

FULL REPORT - BULLFIGHTS IN SPAIN AN INTERNATIONAL INVESTIGATION BY



DALLA PARTE
DEGLI ANIMALI

IN COLLABORATION WITH



S.B.
(Investigation Unit Coordinator – LAV)

With the exclusive veterinary contributions of
José Enrique Zaldívar
(President – AVATMA, Association of Veterinary Abolitionists of Bullfighting and Animal Abuse)

Under coordination and review of
Marta Esteban Miñano
(International Managing Director – Animal Guardians)

BULLFIGHTING IN ALGEMESÍ (VALENCIA)

Period: from 22/09/2019 to 24/09/2019

Places: Bullring of Algemesí / Butcher shop in Algemesí / Center of Algemesí /

Object of the investigation: collection of videos of the process of the bullfights starting in the breeding, followed by the transport, the act in the bullring and the process of converting the body in a meat product.

In the Algemesí's images (as well as in the ones concerning Seville and Madrid) we can see the three standard thirds (tran. phases) of the bullfight: the **Tercio de Varas** (tran. Third of Rods), with passes with the cape and confrontation with the horse of the *picador* (bullfighter on horse), the **Tercio de Banderillas** (tran. Third of Flags) and the **Tercio de Muerte** (tran. Third of Death), which includes the **Faena de Muleta** (cape task used by the bullfighter to tease the bull with a cape), and the process by which, with the use of various weapons (*estoque*, *descabello* and *puntilla*, explained below), the life of these animals is ended in the bullrings.

Before going out to the ring, in the pens, a *divisa* (coloured ribbon), which is a double harpoon measuring 9 cm, is nailed to the bull's neck. It is adorned with coloured ribbons which identify the ranch to which the animal belongs.

First, the **picadores** (bullfighters on horse) act in the first third of the bullfight (*Tercio de Varas*). It is used to measure the animal's bravery, cause intense pain, and weaken him by making him fight against the horse. **At the tip of a long wooden stick, called *puya* (tran. spear) is inserted.** It measures 8.9 cm to what is called the *cruceta* (red area), and it is inserted into the bull's muscles behind the neck. It causes different trajectories, measured during autopsies, of up to 30 cm long. **It causes injury to muscles, ligaments, tendons, nerves, blood vessels and even bone structures of thoracic vertebrae. It produces profuse bleeding.**

After the *Tercio de Varas*, comes the *Tercio de Banderillas* during which **the animal is harpooned with six harpoons that are 6 cm long**, inserted into coloured wooden sticks. **They dig into the muscles previously injured by the *puya*, causing more pain and more bleeding.**

Then comes what is known as the **Tercio de Muerte**, during which the **torero** (professional bullfighter who fights 4/5-year-old bulls) or the **novillero** (bullfighter who bullfights 2/3-year-old animals) performs what is known as the **Faena de Muleta** and, **once the animal is physically and mentally exhausted, he proceeds to kill him.** For this, an **estoque** (a typical bullfighting sword) is used, which measures 80 cm. The *estoque* is inserted into the thorax of the animal. **It produces an intense haemorrhage since it cuts veins, arteries, bronchi and lungs. The consequence is that the animal will suffer an intense suffocation due to blood flooding his thoracic cavity.**

If the animal does not fall to the ground or takes too long to do so, the bullfighter will use another sword, called **descabello** (special sword to apply a thrust to the neck), which **is nailed between the first and second cervical vertebrae and which cuts the spinal cord, leaving the animal quadriplegic.** AVATMA collected evidence of cases in which there have been up to eight failed *descabellos* on the same animal.

Once on the ground, the bull resting on his folded legs, the **puntilla** (special knife) is always **used by a subalterno** (subordinate assistant) of the bullfighter: it is a 10 cm long knife, which **is driven through the occipital bone and the first cervical vertebra, damaging an important nervous centre called the "medulla oblongata", which connects the spinal cord to the brain. The consequence will be the death of the animal, but that does not occur immediately; it can take between one and four minutes for the animal to die. The movements of the legs, which happen while the *puntilla* is being applied, are nervous reflexes in response to an injury to the centre mentioned above, the "medulla oblongata".**

These are not seizures. **There are many cases**, documented through filming, in **which these animals have their ears cut off or they are dragged by the mules out of the bullring, when they are still alive.**

During the *Tercio de Muerte* it is **possible to see that death is a more or less agonizing process**, depending on the placement of the sword, that is, on how it has been nailed to the bull. When the sword or *estoque* penetrates the animal, it can cut various structures: bronchi, lungs, large blood vessels (posterior aorta, caudal vena cava), or not so large and even, if it is placed too far forward, it can section the trachea, and if it goes too far back, go through the diaphragm (muscle that separates the chest from the abdomen). This is why each animal dies in a different way. **Lunges that seem very "accurate"**, because all the steel has entered the animal's body, **are not so much so. We can also see some lunges that dig into bone (vertebrae). Consequently, some bulls vomit blood through the mouth, through the nostrils or through both the mouth and nostrils.** In other cases, no blood comes out. **All this is accompanied**, as it can be seen, **by very fast breathing** (bulls breathe with their mouths open), the result of the great physical effort they have been subjected to during the fight.

Sometimes, as can be seen in some images, we see bulls or *novillos* that fall after the lunge and rise again. It is what we previously pointed out of the "accurate" and not "accurate" lunges that may not be what they seem.

Once the estoque has been introduced in the animal's body, we see how, with the capes, **the subordinates tease the bull.** This is done so that the sword moves within the animal's thorax and accelerates death. **At other times, it can be seen how the sword is removed before proceeding to the coup de grâce with the descabello or puntilla, in order to make the bleeding more intense.** As already mentioned, all animals are finished with the *puntilla*.

About the use of this weapon it must be said that it was prohibited in all slaughterhouses in the European Union because it was considered a cruel way of killing an animal. Bullfights in the bullring are an exception to this rule. It is compulsory that, before proceeding to the bleeding of the animals slaughtered in slaughterhouses, that they are previously stunned (in the case of cattle, this is done with what is known as a captive bullet pistol that applied to the skull causes the loss of awareness). About this, the Association of Veterinarians for the Abolition of Bullfighting and Animal Mistreatment (AVATMA) prepared a **report**¹ which was presented at the European Parliament.

The bullring of Algemesí is built and managed by the *cadafals* (group of friends who get together for partying). **Every year the tiers of the bullring are auctioned.** They have permission to sell tickets and win money, but, as one of the managers told to the investigator, this is difficult, **their cadafal paid this year 19.100 euros for the tier.** Members of cadafal and their young kids can be seen on the tiers.

Bulls are brought to the bullring through an *encierro*. This act is done every morning and it consists of making the bulls run through the streets (Sometimes also during the night, but it is not usual). Fragments of running of the bulls can be seen in the images: **sometimes the animals that participate in the encierro are the same that will be killed later during the bullfight, sometimes not.** As it can be seen, the *novillos* are led by being beaten with sticks.

All the animals killed in the novilladas (bullfights with young male bovines as the one in Algemesí) **are 3 years old. The ages and names of the lidia** (fighting breed cattle are: **bulls (4 and 5 years old); novillos (2 and 3 years old); becerros (less than 2 years old).** The bullfighters in the filming are called *novilleros* because they kill *novillos*. These bullfighters are trying to get to be *toreros*. To be a *novillero* (bullfighter of 2/3 years-old animals) is the previous step to being a *torero* who can fight 4/5 years old bulls.

¹ <https://avatma.org/2018/03/16/avatma-lleva-el-maltrato-animal-en-mataderos-y-la-tauromaquia-a-debate-al-parlamento-europeo/>

Dead bulls are moved outside the ring and put openly on a scraper bucket, close to really young kids and people in general.

In Algemesi some footages documented another type of show within the bullfighting demonstrations of that town, which comes to be like the presentation of the *novillos* that will be fought in the bullring later. This is called *desencajonada* (*tran*. “to take out of the box”).



During the *desencajonada*, the *novillos* that will be fought the next day are released for a while within the bullring and will be fought the next day. As it can be seen, the fear they feel makes them group together, that is, unite to defend themselves. It is not unusual that, on occasions, there are clashes between some of these animals, but to avoid them, the *cabestros* (tame leading-ox) are used. These are males of certain breeds of cattle that have been castrated, and of a peaceful nature. Once the *novillos* have spent a few minutes in the arena, they are led to the corrals in the bullring.

Subsequently, **an *encierro* [running of bulls] is shown with *becerros* [less than 2-year-old male calves].** The animals in the filming are probably just over 1 year old. They will not be killed publicly by bullfighting apprentices. These calves will later be slaughtered in the same bullring, but out of public view. **Until a few years ago, these calves were killed in the arena by simple fans, residents of the town, who even stuck *banderillas* on them.** It was a Dantesque spectacle that every year was denounced by the movement for the abolition of bullfighting, until ***the Algemesi city council, due to pressure, decided that they would stop killing the animal in public*** and transformed them into what is reflected in the video. Here is a video which shows how *becerradas* used to be before that:

<https://youtu.be/YDzMWi7ubRs>

The meat from the bulls killed in the bullfights of Algemesi is sold in the butcher shop of the town exclusively. He has been doing it for forty years. The butcher explains all the process in one of our filming.

Transcription from dialogue:

Butcher: I have been selling the meat from here for 40 years. That is why I have told you, "not the prices", due to the issue of competition.

Investigator: Aren't you the only ones selling it?

Butcher: From the town yes. Bull meat can be sold by anyone, any butcher can sell bull meat. But I have the sole right for the one from the bullring.

After being killed in the bullring the bull is bled out, the meat analysed, cut in pieces at a slaughterhouse, and then taken to the butcher shop. We tried to get into the place where bulls are bled out, but they stopped us at the entrance as the butcher (who had invited us there) was not in the place at that moment.

Transcription from dialogue:

Investigator: I have been invited to see the process (...)

Attendant: The butcher did not come today.

Person from the slaughterhouse: If he's not here, we can't let you pass.

The meat of these animals has a particular consideration in the Spanish Food Code. Its treatment, conservation and analysis are regulated by a Royal Decree². This meat is of poor quality and can be easily contaminated.

The legislation on it says, among other things:

“However, considering the special conditions of pre-treatment of the bullfighting cattle give the meat obtained from these cattle characteristics similar to the meat of wild game animals, their production and commercialization must be done in a similar way to that provided for in Royal Decree 2044/1994, of October 14, which establishes the sanitary and animal health conditions applicable to the slaughter of wild game animals and the production and commercialization of their meats”.

“1) Bullfighting livestock meat may only be sold fresh, subjected to refrigeration or freezing, if they comply with the provisions of the preceding articles.

2) The sale of bullfighting beef meat in meat retail establishments is allowed provided that they are placed on the counter perfectly identified, with the mention «Bullfighting meat», and clearly separated from the other meats and from the rest of the products that are sold in these establishments.

3) The transformation of bullfighting meat into meat products and preparations or other products of animal origin is prohibited.

4) Minced beef meat is prohibited.”

Given the special characteristics of the meat obtained from these animals, which have been subjected to enormous stress and strenuous physical exercise in all the bullfighting events in which they are used, **the Food Code establishes strict hygiene and health measures for their production, treatment and marketing, which are established in the Royal Decree.** This Royal Decree includes those bullfighting cattle that have been used in bullfighting within a bullring, popular festivals, bullfighting behind closed doors, training or teaching practice and *tentaderos*.

The meat of the bulls fought is a by-product of bullfighting with limited conditional use as food, and with poor preservation. **The bull meat is dark, hard, dry and contaminated, due to the stress of transport and the bullfight, to emotional change, intense muscular work and wounds.** The meat that is used after the bullfight is of a very secondary interest, which is always subject to its fundamental purpose. The meat of bullfighting is therefore a by-product. **Its dark colour, hardness, dryness and poor preservation are the negative characteristics that determine it; therefore, it is not accepted as normal meat in distribution chains.** Very little is paid for the meat of these animals, more or less 1 euro per kilo, given its terrible quality. It is important to distinguish between the meat of animals which have participated in a bullfight, and the meat of animals of bullfighting breed that have not participated in a bullfight. The latter does not comply with the regulations outlined above.

When the "mad cow" disease was declared, a circumstance mentioned by the butcher in the filming, all the meat of animals that had participated in bullfighting was confiscated and burned. Currently, only the central nervous system is seized. The tails are marketed because they

² <https://www.boe.es/buscar/act.php?id=BOE-A-2002-5205>

have no spinal cord. The corpses are taken to the slaughterhouse, where they are inspected by veterinarians, and then marketed. **It is important to insist on the poor quality of this meat, and the little commercial outlet that it has.** It is so bad that, in many towns in Spain, the residents organized what was called *calderetas* (tran: stew): they met on the street to cook the meat of the animals that had participated in a bullfight and ate them. Nowadays, in the towns that continue to make *calderetas*, the meat has been replaced by regular beef.

In the filming it was possible to show what happens when a bullfighter does a good job. The president of the bullring, **at the request of the audience, whose wishes he may or may not follow, decides which is his prize. This prize can be the ears or tail of the bull, which usually are thrown to the public by the bullfighter.** In some footages we can see how kids play with the ear of the bull, throwing it to each other.

Sometimes the common bullfights are mixed with *rejoneo* which is a different type of act. This is all done by a person riding a horse and was also filmed during this reportage. The *rejoneo* is a bullfight on horseback. **In the images we can see an exhausted novillo who shows no interest in charging the horse.** The weapons used in this form of bullfighting are several and called: *farpas*, *rejones*, *rejones de castigo* and *rejón de muerte*.

In this form of bullfighting, there has been cases of horses that have been gored by bulls and that are left with their guts out to die in the same bullring. AVATMA can provide some pictures as evidence upon request. There are also what are called “mixed celebrations with *rejones*”, in which bullfighting on foot (by *toreros* or *novilleros*) is allowed along with the bullfight on horseback (by *rejoneadores*).

BULLFIGHTING IN SEVILLE

Period: from 26/09/2019 to 01/10/2019

Places: Ganadería located in Las Panajosas, Sevilla / Ganadería located in Castillo de La Guarda, Sevilla / Bullfights in La Maestranza Bullring, in Seville / Restaurants and Butcher shop in Sevilla /

Object of the investigation: collection of footages of the process of the bullfights starting in the breeding ranches, followed by the act in the bullring and the process of converting the body into a meat product.

Two ranches where bullfighting bulls are bred were visited by our investigators. But it is important to remark that not all bullfighting ranches are placed in pasturelands called *dehesas*³ (tran. meadows). **These types of spaces are subsidized with funds from the European Union⁴ and by some autonomous communities** such as Extremadura, Andalusia, Castilla La Mancha and Castilla and León. The defence of bullfighting ranches is based on the fact that they support the existence of *dehesas* and their biodiversity. We do not know the exact number of hectares of *dehesas* in Spain, but we estimate that there are approximately 3 million of them. **Bullfighting ranches occupy, at most, 10% of Spanish dehesas, that is 300,000 hectares**, but in many of them, in addition to raising bullfighting cattle, farmers raise other domestic species, especially the Iberian pig, other type of cattle or wild animals (hunting species) for hunting. Therefore, in the hypothetical case that this breed, the bullfighting one, disappeared or its number of examples diminished (there are around

³ The *dehesas* are a traditional system for the exploitation of natural resources in the Iberian Peninsula in which agricultural, logging and ranching uses are integrated. The *dehesas* are human-made environments where unfavourable physical conditions exist: poor land (with little organic and mineral cover and a tendency to erosion) and a harsh climate (long, hot summers and cold, wet winters).

⁴ This is important because the subsidies of the Common Agricultural Policy (mentioned above) are related to the space occupied by the farm, in different amounts, depending on the type of space, and the *dehesas* are one of them.

Dehesa farms have been receiving an average amount ranging from € 40 - € 50 per hectare from which the bullfighting farms located on them, also benefit. Source: <https://agroinformacion.com/la-dehesa-ante-la-reforma-del-reglamento-omnibus-la-pac/>

200.000 at present), the *dehesas* would not disappear. **In the filming many animals are seen in small pens.**

Some of the most important general findings are:

- Stud bulls spend half of the year with a group of cows, so that they impregnate them.
- The farmers decide which bulls will be studs and mothers by their aspect, body and also by testing them in small corridas that sometimes take place in small bullrings in the farm⁵. All the cows in a ranch go through the trials, which are called *tentaderos* and take place in small bullrings in the farms. Sometimes, not too often, males are also “tempted” when they are 2 or 3 years old. Cows that pass the test stay as mothers, and those that do not, go to the slaughterhouse. Their meat is marketed as bullfighting meat, so it is subjected to the regulations outlined above (Royal Decree). The males that pass the trial will be tested as studs, and those that do not will be sold for “popular bullfighting” (not in bullrings). Some of those who passed the test may end up in a bullring, but only if no *cape* or *muleta* has been used in the *tentadero*, that is, if they were not fought but only faced with the *picador*'s horse.

There are three ways for a bull to become a *semental* (tran. stud), according to the worker:

1) If he is *indultado* (tran. pardoned) in the bullring.

2) If he is chosen by the farmers, due to his genetics and morphology. After having chosen them, they need to pass a test in a small private bullring to become a *semental*.

3) The worker does not explain the third way but starts a discussion focused on how many cows can be impregnated by bullfighting bulls studs. All these statements shows how the farm is surely not focused on beef, but on bullfighting.

- According to bullfighting regulations, **when an animal has been fought with a *cape* or *muleta*, he cannot be used in a bullfight because they are dangerous since they might have learned from the experience.** In some few ranches, a practice called “*acoso y derribo*” (tran. harassment and knockdown) is performed by men on horseback. Its purpose is to harass and knock down usually calves, within a limited area and over a period of time. To do this, the two participants use a pole or tubular rod of three meters long, which has a sharp metal piece at one end (*puya*).
- On the pardoned bulls during bullfights that later become studs: **only 0.6% of the bulls fought are pardoned, and many of them die later, in the same bullring, during the transport back to the ranch or on the same farm, for various reasons, but mainly due to the wounds they have suffered or due to immunosuppression** (lowering of defences) **due to stress.**
- Bulls are fed grass and feed, legumes, cereals and supplements... More or less that is their diet. **A few months before the bullfight, the *novillos* and bulls are separated in corrals and fattened to reach the regulated weight according to the category** of the bullring in which they will be killed.
- In the ranch located in Las Panajosas **bulls get less and less space every year⁶** of their lives, so that they get bigger and develop muscles. Bulls are forced to run every

⁵ Family tree: all the animals, once they have been marked with fire, are included in the family tree, which collects their pedigree. It is the official document with which they will then participate in a bullfight or used in popular celebrations. Many frauds have been discovered in this type of documentation, even documents of dead animals have been used in the ranches, as if they were still alive.

⁶ Everything the rancher says in the footages, regarding the reduction of the space in which the animals live according to their age is true. It can be clearly heard that as the age of the animals increases, the space in which they live is reduced: 4-year-old bulls, live in half an hectare. We have already commented that when a rancher sells animals for a bullfighting celebration, he needs to make them gain weight so that they have the right weight according to regulation and to the category of the bullring to which they go. Fattening them takes several months, usually between six and eight.

day with the same goal.

- Bulls do not attack red things. They attack things that move around them when they feel in danger. **What the farmer says about these animals only being able to see in black and white is false.** Indeed, they do not see the colours clearly, but it is known that chromatic stimulants attract their attention, that is, bright colours such as red, orange or yellow. That is why the capes are of those colour. They do not see red as such, but they are more attracted to it. AVATMA released two studies in Spanish concerning the vision of the bullfighting bull that corroborate this⁷. What is certain is that the bulls see very well from afar (hyperopic) and poorly from near distances (astigmatism) and that they attack the movement of capes. Furthermore, they have a blind field of vision of approximately one meter. The reason for this is that their eyes are lateral regarding their placement in the bull's head.
- The worker from the ranch located in Las Panajosas admits getting European money through the "mother cows" (**Common Agricultural Policy - CAP**). Based on rancher in Europe gets **subsidies** if they have a cow that gives birth, but it is not money dedicated exclusively to bullfights.⁸

Transcription from dialogue:

*Investigator: Have ranches benefited from entering Europe?
Does the European Community help in any way?*

Farm worker: Absolutely not. Many times, it is said that we have subsidies and it is a lie. The only subsidy there is, is for the mother for being a suckler cow, just like any cow.

Investigator: It doesn't matter if it is a cow from another industry such as meat or milk for example?

*Farm Worker: Exactly.
So what they pay you is a subsidy for a cow that gives birth, for a cow that is a mother.*

Investigator: But does that subsidy come from Europe or does it come from the Andalusian Government?

Farm Worker: No, no, from Europe.

- **Two members of the farm** located in Castillo de La Guarda (one of the oldest and most important in Spain) **explain their reason why the bulls have a cover:**

"...The horns have these things to protect the bull when there are fights, and it's also an aesthetic decision, so they grow in a beautiful way..."



⁷ 1- <https://avatma.org/sobre-la-vision-del-toro-en-la-lidia/>
2- <http://www.opinionytoros.com/reportajes.php?id=226>

⁸ This is a half-truth. Indeed, the European Union subsidizes suckler cows, and it does not matter whether it is a bullfighting bovine breed or another breed, but since the Common Agricultural Policy is currently decoupled from production, they also receive subsidies, the most important, for the space occupied by the farm, in different amounts, depending on the type of space in which the animals live based on the extent and other maintenance parameters of that space. In the same way, they also have aids per animal that reaches eight months, and for the meat product that is obtained. In addition, they also receive aid, at the national level, because it is a native Spanish breed of development. Currently, in Spain, there are about 200.000 heads of cattle of this breed, of both sexes and different ages.

Chipped horns can be seen in some images, which is usually due to prior manipulation to reduce their length. **This is known as *afeitado*** (tran. shaving) and consists of reducing the length of the bull's horn by cutting it. Then, to give it a normal appearance, **the horns are scrapped and sanded until they are rebuilt with the new size**. The bullfighter thus takes on the effort of bullfighting more easily and the fans believe that he is dealing with an intact bull, with his horns intact. **These animals use the tips of their horns to measure distances**. If a small piece of their horns is removed (*afeitado*), the bulls will be limited in their measurement capacity and they will not be able to perform it properly. If more evidence about these fraudulent practices is required, AVATMA can provide information about it.

AVATMA carried out a report⁹ (with photos included), which was presented to some MEPs, explaining parts of the life of these animals in bullfighting farms, which is not as harmless as ranchers say it is.

For this reportage the **bullfights in Seville were filmed. Everything took place in La Maestranza** bullring, considered **one of the most important bullrings in the world and one of the oldest**, as it was built in 1881. It has capacity for 12.000 people.

Shocking images of the “corridas” and all of their phases or Thirds were obtained. The images show something similar to what Algemesi offered. During the *Tercio de Varas* (tran. Third of Rods) there's the bull's response to pain. During the *Tercio de Banderillas* (tran. Third of Flags) there's the responses to the pain felt by animals, constantly turning their heads towards the nailed harpoons and during the *Tercio de Muerte* (tran. Third of Death) there are different thrusts with the *estoque* sword, the *descabello* sword and at the end with the *puntilla* knife.

The images also reflect those moments in which, some bulls, after receiving the thrust of the *estoque*, **look for the exit of the bullring**, and they go, walking slowly, to the place where they came out, which is called *puerta de toriles* (tran. *bullpens door*). **On other occasions, they defend themselves by placing their back against the barrier**, from which they know they cannot be attacked.



Other animals that suffer in bullfights are the *picador's* horses. They are blindfolded, and their ears are plugged, so they do not know what is happening around them. **As it can be seen in one of the films, a bull knocks down one of these horses**. Once this happens, it is very difficult to lift them, since the protecting pad they wear prevents them from normal movements of their limbs. That pad, which is to protect them from the goring, weighs about 25 kilos.

Even so, **although it is not very frequent, there are some of these horses that suffer goring if the bull or the *novillo* is able to put its head under the pad**. **All of them suffer bruises from the bulls hitting them**. They are usually horses of a certain age, about seven or eight years old, that have been tamed for this purpose and weigh, on average, 570 kilos. **These horses belong to various owners and are rented for these celebrations**.

After being bled out, **bulls are taken in groups of three to the slaughterhouse**. **Shocking footage of the dead bulls being loaded in the truck were filmed**, also in broad the daylight, with the presence of children and common people around.

⁹ <https://avatma.org/2017/06/22/maltrato-animal-en-las-ganaderias-de-lidia/>

A lot of restaurants around Seville claim to sell bull meat. In most of them, it is cow beef what they cook and serve, according to the butchers. Usually, what is commonly offered as *rabo de toro* (tran. bull tail) is cow tail.

The butcher shop that officially sells part of the bulls in the Maestranza bullring was also visited. It is located in a shopping center in the centre of Seville. The butcher shop worker (not the owner) says the meat being sold there is from one of the bulls killed two days before. It is evident how cheap the meat of these animals is by the prices shown in the video.

Transcription from dialogue:

Investigator: I have been told that here you sell meat from La Maestranza.

Butcher Shop Assistant: Yes, this is it.

Investigator: But is it from this weekend?

Butcher Shop Assistant: Yes, this meat is from the novillada on Friday (Note: the bullfight mentioned was filmed in the reportage).

In another dialogue, the butcher shop assistant says that many restaurants in Seville claim to sell bull's meat, but that, in most of them, they cook and serve cow's meat as if it were bull's one. This fraud is very similar to that of bluefin tuna.

Transcription from dialogue:

Investigator: If I go to a restaurant now, asking for a bull's tail, there is a high chance it's not.

Butcher Shop Assistant: Sure.

Investigator: Cow or beef?

Butcher Shop Assistant: Both.

Our investigators have also had the chance to visit a bullfighting school located in Camas, near Seville. Considered a great school, the teacher and owner has been a bullfighter for a long time.

During a dialogue, the cost of seven bulls to be killed in a first-category bullring such as La Maestranza was exposed¹⁰.

Transcription from dialogue:

Investigator: How much can six bulls for La Maestranza be valued? 60.000 euros?

Bullfighting School's Teacher: It depends on the ranch.

¹⁰ It is important to remark that sale prices depend on the quality of the livestock, on the category of the bullring in which they will be fought, on the age of the animals, and on the type for celebration in which they are going to be used.

*Teacher's Son: V***** (Bulls Farm brand) doesn't sell them for less than 80,000 euros.*

To the question about support from public subsidies, the answer is **the school is fully subsidised¹¹ by the City Hall** and not by others (politicians) who the teacher openly offends in our filming.

Transcription from dialogue:

Investigator: *Is there any aid received, as a bullfighting school, from the Ministry of Culture or Education or something else, or is it just from the City Hall?*

Bullfighting School's Teacher: From the City Hall and nothing else.

During the visit the teacher's son spoke about some facts concerning the story of the school at the beginnings. **Built in the 90's, it was opened after pressures made by his father and other toreros to politicians and to the City Council.** Currently, the school teaches to around 30 students There is no selection of any type. Any candidate can attend the lectures, even from other towns.

It is important to notice that on 2 February 2018, The UN's Committee of the Rights of the Child issued the Concluding observations on the combined fifth and sixth periodic reports of Spain (CRC/C/ESP/CO/5-6). On section E Violence against children- Bullfighting Page 7 article 25, it states that *"In order to prevent the harmful effects of bullfighting on children, the Committee recommends that the State party prohibit the participation of children under 18 years of age as bullfighters and as spectators in bullfighting events."* Clearly, this recommendation from the world's most important authority on children rights is not respected in Spain, where Animal Guardians has evidence of children as young as 14 years-old killing novillos in bullfights.

BULLFIGHTING IN MADRID

Period: from 04/10/2019 to 07/10/2019

Places: Bullfights in las Ventas Bullring, in Madrid / Ganadería (Bull Ranch) located in Colmenar del Arroyo, Madrid /

Object of the investigation: collection of videos of the bullfight in the bullring and the transport on the spot for the process of converting the body into a meat product. In addition, a load of bulls from a ranch for a planned *encierro* and a bullfight in the town Chapinería (Madrid) was filmed.

Las Ventas is considered the most important bullring in the world. It can contain 24.000 people. **During the first day, there were some politicians, such as Santiago Abascal, the leader of the extreme-right Spanish party VOX, who is taking selfies with very young kids.** It is common to see members of the royal family openly supporting bullfighting. The King Emeritus (Juan Carlos I) is a great fan, and has made statements on its behalf on numerous occasions, as has one of his daughters, Infanta Elena and her two children. Queen Emeritus Sofia is not; instead, she is known for being an animal lover. The current acting king, Felipe VI, only seldom

¹¹ In addition, most bullfighting schools receive not only aid from municipalities, but also from county councils and autonomous communities. It is relevant to say all schools of this type are subsidized with taxpayer money, coming from city councils, county councils and a autonomous communities to a greater or lesser extent.

attends bullfighting, like his wife, although they have never questioned this activity and have made statements in its defence on several occasions.

Shocking images of the "corridas" and all of their phases or Thirds were filmed. Some of the most important general findings are:

- In the first footages **we can see how the bullfighter positions the bull to strike with the *estoque* sword. But he fails to nail it in the right place. This creates a haemorrhage through the mouth of the bull, who suffers slow suffocation.** The animal lifts his head gasping for air. The assistants tease him with the cape to increase the damage produced by the sword nailed inside his body. Finally, the bull is stabbed in the nape with the *puntilla*.
- **Other images show the exit of the bull through the *puerta de toriles*** (tran. bullpen door). The coloured (green) ribbons that are in place thanks to the *dívida* (double harpoon nailed to the animal's neck right before it comes out to the bullring) can easily be seen. **The bull falls several times. He cannot stand. It can be due to several causes: excessive doping, neurological alteration, ruminal acidosis problems (a pathology of these animals).** This bull, by order of the president of the bullring, is returned to the pens. That is why the *cabestros* (tame leading oxes) come out. This bull will be killed with the *puntilla* knife in the pens and replaced by another (for what they call a *sombrero* [tran. hat] bull).



- **A *Faena de Muleta*** (the cape task, during which the bullfighter teases the bull with a cape) **is shown. The left horn is chipped, which usually indicates that his horns have been manipulated. A sheathed bull that has these protections removed shortly before the bullfight will measure distances worse than one that has not been sheathed.** The *estoque* (tran. sword) lunge punctures the bone. Second sword lunge. **The *puntilla* knife is**

driven 12 times into the animal's nape, which shows the long agony of these animals. We can see the fear of the *puntillero* (man using the *puntilla* knife) when the animal is too "alive". **We see how the bull rises after having been badly stabbed.** Again,

- Again in *Tercio de Varas* (tran. Third of Rods), **it can be seen how the picador, repeatedly thrusts and removes the *puya*** (sharp tip of the spear) **in the bull's back. This means that one official puncture really turns into several ones.** The bull falls down as he moves away from the horse because **the *puya* has injured the nerves related to the innervation, or nerve conduction, of the forelimbs.**
- During the *Tercio de Banderillas* (tran. Third of Flags) it can be observed a new fall of the bull. **Falls during the fight are frequent due to fatigue and nerve damage that affects locomotion.**
- During the *Tercio de Muerte* (tran. Third of Death), a complete and accurate *estoque* lunge is observed. **The prizes that the bullfighters receive** (ears and/or tail) **depend on the *Faena de Muleta* (the cape task) and on them killing the animal "correctly".** It may happen that if a bullfighter has fought the bull well and kills in a wrong way (not accurate), he will be left without a prize. **Tails are seldom granted since they prefer to reserve them for the restaurants.** Finished the task, the bullfighter salutes and the bull is dragged out of the rings by the mules. A banner is shown: the bullfighter, called Cid, was retiring from bullfighting on that day.

- In the following bullfight, during the Tercio de Banderillas it **can be observed how the bull scratches the sandy ground with his forelimbs. Wrongly considered a sign of bravery, it is really a sign of fear.**
- Again, in the *Tercio de Muerte*, **a full but not accurate estoque lunge is performed, followed by the cape dance. Here we can observe how the bull places his back against the barrier to protect himself from behind.** Two lunges with the *descabello* sword are carried out to try to bring the bull to the ground. Finally, the *puntilla* knife is applied. **On this occasion, while the bull is being withdrawn by the mules, the public whistles to the bull:** the bull can be applauded or whistled during the drag, depending on whether he has pleased the public or not during his plight.
- **In the subsequent images the slaughterhouse of the bullring, where the meat is processed, is shown.** Las Ventas is so big that it has its own slaughterhouse inside. The treatment and marketing of the meat was already commented above. **In these footages the presence of the blood after the transport of the bull by the mulilleros, left in “contact” with the public that uses the gate nearby as entrance/exit can be appreciated.**
- Some footages in Madrid show some restaurants. One of them, located on the outskirts of the square, buys all the tails of the bullfighting fair of San Isidro, the most important in the capital of Madrid and that takes place in spring. During the evening, it was possible to see the celebration of a bullfighter being carried shoulder-high. It occurs, in Madrid, when a bullfighter has been awarded with the ears of the two bulls he has fought.
- The day after there was the chance to film a *Paseillo* (a presentation, before the bullfight of the workers participating in it, who come out in the area and salute the public) in the bullring. Their names are: *alguacillos* (in black on horseback), bullfighters, subordinates, picadors, *monosabios* (in red), *areneros* (in green), and *mulilleros* (in white).
- Then, another *Tercio de Varas*. The subordinates with their capes, are placed to the left of the picador's horse. The right side is free because the regulation says that this side must be left open for the bull to flee. As it can be seen, to prevent this, the picador turns his horse and prevents the bull from scaping through that side. **We can see another takedown of the horse,** something we have already explained above.
- During *Tercio de Muerte*, **a full estoque lunge is observed but it is not accurate.** Movement of capes by subordinates (to cause further damage of the sword inside the bull's body). **Again we can see how the bull takes refuge against the barrier to defend himself.** It is called *acularse en tablas*, which means placing its rear against the boards of the barrier.
- Then again, a *Tercio de Varas*. It can be seen how the bull is prevented from leaving through the right side and **how the bull falls down after the punctures. This is common,** and the reason, **as we have explained, is that some punctures injure some of the nerves that deal with the innervation of the forelimbs.**
- An image of a bullfighter is seen receiving the bull in the *porta gayola* position, that is, on his knees. **After that the bull falls on the ground dangerously,** for the

reasons explained above.

- During the next *Tercio de Muerte*, a full rear *estoque* lunge can be seen, which pierces the diaphragm. We can see the bull having hiccups, which is typical of this type of lunges. The bull is stabbed 5 times with the *puntilla*. When the bull is still very much alive, and there is a danger that he may rise, the *puntilleros* are afraid and stab the knife in a clumsy way, having to do so several times.
- In the next images, the exit of a bull through the *puerta de toriles* (tran. bullpen door) can be seen: fear, uncertainty, the doubt of being in a place that is unknown to him. He tries to go back to the place he came from.
- There was also the chance to film some images of the bullfighting museum and stuffed bulls. Other images show the slaughterhouse of the bullring, in a moment when the slaughterhouse's workers exhorted the investigator not to film the scenes. Also the exit of the refrigerated truck was filmed, while a van enters, perhaps to collect the bull tails for the restaurants.
- It was possible to film inside another bullfighting ranch located in Colmenar del Arroyo (Madrid). During the visit, the animals were easily frightened. These are fearful animals when they are in a herd or group, but that they become dangerous when they are alone in and in small spaces.
- Transportation for an encierro and a bullfight planned during the afternoon is also showed in the video. The animals are encased in small metal boxes for hours and hours from the ranch to the bullring, often under the summer heat. There are studies showing that, due to stress, these animals can lose up to 30 kilos during transport. AVATMA reports that this way of transferring these animals does not comply with European regulations and that they have made this known to the European Union¹².
- The images also show also calves (8 months old, more or less) grouped in a corral moments prior to fire marking, which is known as *herrado*: four fire marks, as reported in an article from AVATMA¹³. This painful practice, which was previously used on other breeds of cattle (for example, the "*morucha*"), is currently meaningless, since it could easily be replaced by a chip, which could include all the information captured on the fire marks. Chipping is already being done in Europe on other species, such as domestic dogs, cats and equidae. There are studies that show the enormous stress and suffering of these animals in this type of situation.

¹² <https://avatma.org/2017/12/18/informe-sobre-el-incumplimiento-en-el-transporte-de-bovinos-de-lidia/>

¹³ <https://avatma.org/2017/06/22/maltrato-animal-en-las-ganaderias-de-lidia/>



Final Review – June 2020

For any further informations on the contents of this report please contact:



DALLA PARTE
DEGLI ANIMALI

Roberto Bennati

(General Manager – LAV)

Email: r.bennati@lav.it

Tel: +39 320 473 0673



Marta Esteban Miñano

(International Managing Director – Animal Guardians)

Email: martalt nec@gmail.com

Tel: +34 606 300 906



José Enrique Zaldívar

(President – AVATMA)

Email: jezaldivar1@gmail.com

Tel: +34 629 22 37 20